Detection of Methane in the Atmosphere of Mars

Vittorio Formisano,1* Sushil Atreya,2 Thérèse Encrenaz,3 Nikolai Ignatiev,1,4 Marco Giuranna1

1Istituto di Fisica dello Spazio Interplanetario INAF-IFSI, Via del Fosso del Cavaliere 100, 00133 Roma, Italy. 2Department of Atmospheric, Oceanic, and Space Sciences, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109–2143, USA. 3Laboratoire d’Etudes Spatiales et d’Instrumentation en Astrophysique (LESIA), Observatoire de Paris, 5 Place Janssen, 92195 Meudon, France. 4Space Research Institute of Russian Academy of Sciences (IKI) Profsojuznaja 84/32, 117810 Moscow, Russia.

*To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: formisan@nike.ifsi.rm.cnr.it

We report a detection of methane in the martian atmosphere by the Planetary Fourier Spectrometer onboard the Mars Express spacecraft. The global average methane mixing ratio (I) is found to be 10±5 part per billion by volume (ppbv). However the mixing ratio varies between 0 ppbv and 30 ppbv over the planet. The source of methane could be either biogenic or non-biogenic, including past or present subsurface microorganisms, hydrothermal activity, or cometary impacts.

Methane is an important tracer of possible biological, internal, or atmospheric processes on Mars. The possibility of methane producing bacteria or microorganisms on Mars has been suggested in the past (2, 3). The source of methane could also be in the water-rock reactions in the martian interior (4, 5), or volcanic hot spots (6). Another possibility is external sources such as cometary impacts (7).

The Planetary Fourier Spectrometer (PFS) (8) operates in the infrared, covering a wavelength range of 1.2–45 μm (220–8190 cm−1) in two spectral channels, the short wavelength (SW) from 1.2 to 5.5 μm and the long wavelength (LW) from 5.5 to 45 μm (9, 10). The spectral resolution is 1.3 cm−1, and the spatial resolution ~10 km near pericenter. Sampling is done every 1.02 cm−1.

1680 spectra were averaged together to obtain a global spectrum (Fig. 1A). An average of 2931 spectra taken in 24 orbits during a following period in May 2004 is shown in Fig. 1B.

The electronic noise of the instrument providing one sigma (67%) confidence level in the measurements was computed from measurements of deep space. For the short wavelength channel of PFS, deep space corresponds to a source of radiance intensity zero, hence it provides a measure of the instrumental noise (11). The noise equivalent radiance (NER) of a single spectrum at 3000 cm−1 is 0.01 erg/s/cm²sr/cm−1. Accordingly, the S/N ratios for our two data sets are about 1300 (Fig. 1A) and 1500 (Fig. 1B) respectively. A number of solar and water vapor lines can be identified in the spectrum. However, certain features, particularly the ones at 3006.5, 3009, 3018 cm−1 are not associated with any presently known molecules of the martian atmosphere. Figure 2, A and B, show a comparison of the averaged data with synthetic spectra calculated with a mean H₂O mixing ratio of 350 ppm. With a depth of about 1%, i.e. more than 10 times above the noise level, the line at 3018 cm−1 is significant, since it corresponds to the line position of maximum methane absorption in this wavenumber region (ν3-Q branch). We identify this feature with methane by comparing it to a synthetic spectrum (13, 14) (see red curve in Fig. 2), and determine the abundance of methane in the atmosphere from the line depth. Other methane lines present in this region have been checked, but are found to be less intense than the one presented by at least a factor 3–4. Many are hidden in water or solar lines. One of them, at 3028 cm−1, is shown in the figures. Its behavior is similar to that of the main line at 3018 cm−1, however, it is is too weak for evaluating the mixing ratio and it is also partially contaminated by water vapor lines.

At 3011 cm−1, on the left side of a strong solar line, the discrepancy between the observed and synthetic spectra reflects an instrumental (“overshooting”) effect which is frequently present in the PFS spectra in the red wing of single strong lines. Apart from this departure, a possible explanation

www.scienceexpress.org / 28 October 2004 / Page 1/ 10.1126/science.1101732
for the discrepancies observed at other frequencies (3002, 3007, 3009 cm$^{-1}$) is that they are due to unidentified minor molecular species. Further discrepancies can be due to (1) H$_2$O spectroscopic parameters, or insufficient mixing ratio; (2) surface albedo (which, in the 3000 cm$^{-1}$ range, can be affected by mineralogic signatures of hydrated minerals). However, we believe that the identification of methane at 3018 cm$^{-1}$ is definite, in view of the good fit of its wavenumber position.

The slope of the synthetic spectrum of the martian atmosphere (Fig. 2, A and B) indicates the presence of water ice clouds in the equatorial region of Mars. Indeed, the quality of the fits improves when such clouds are included in the synthetic spectra. In the synthetic spectra the water ice cloud particles have an effective dimension of 1.25 µm (15) and optical constants from (16) have been used. From the direct comparison between the PFS spectra and the synthetic spectra (Figs. 2, A and B), we find that the observed line depth corresponds to a methane mixing ratio of approximately 10 ppbv, or somewhat greater. Considering the uncertainty of the fitting with synthetic spectrum (11), we derive a conservative CH$_4$ mixing ratio of 10±5 ppbv. The synthetic calculations also show that, as the individual lines are not saturated, the depth of the v$_4$ Q-branch should increase almost linearly with increasing mixing ratio, and this fact can be used to identify and study variations of the methane mixing ratio.

An examination of orbits with higher air mass factor can provide greater confidence in our analysis, as the methane line depth should increase with increasing CH$_4$ amounts along the line of sight. This is possible to do because occasionally Mars Express does not point to the nadir, its normal operation mode, but at a slant angle due to its inertial attitude. This results in an increased air mass in the line of sight, which implies that the line of sight abundance of methane should also increase, while its mixing ratio is expected to remain unchanged. The average spectrum over 121 measurements taken during the pericenter pass of orbit 145, with an air mass factor of 1.12 is shown in Fig. 3. Upon taking into account the air mass factor we obtain a methane mixing ratio 30±5 ppbv. This value is higher than the global average ratio of 10±5 ppbv and indicates that the methane mixing ratio may be variable. Motivated by this possibility, we have examined several other orbits, including orbit 68, 202, and 72, for which the air mass factors are, respectively, 1.03, 1.33, and 2.1. We discovered that orbit 72, for which the air mass factor (2.1) was even greater than in orbit 145 (1.12), gives another extreme in CH$_4$. Since the number of measurements for this case (120) is close to those in orbit 145, a similar sigma value is obtained. Figure 4 gives the average PFS spectrum for orbit 72. However, there is no indication of the methane line, and the synthetic spectrum with no methane fits the data nicely.

As the synthetic spectrum fitting orbit 72 data, has been computed using the same solar spectrum as we used for other fits, this indicates that the 3018 cm$^{-1}$ line was not due to the Sun. From the four orbits 68, 145, 202, and 72, with respective air mass factors of 1.03, 1.12, 1.33, and 2.1, methane mixing ratios of 9, 30, 30, and 0 ppbv are derived by comparing the observed methane line depth to synthetic spectra, after taking into account the air mass factors. In the case of Orbit 72, we conclude that the methane abundance is below our detectability limit, i.e. lower than 5 ppbv.

The above variation in CH$_4$ could represent either spatial or temporal changes or both. As the time span of our observations (January through May 2004) is short compared to the martian year (almost 2 Earth’s years) and seasons (about 6 months each), the CH$_4$ variation mentioned above can be studied versus spatial changes. Space variations could be present due to localized sources and/or localized surface sinks. We can attempt to determine whether the spatial variations occur over a large range of longitude by dividing our original 16 orbits (or 24 orbits) into 3 longitudinal ranges: longitudes -55° to -170° (orbits: 10, 30, 32, 41, 44, 202), longitudes +52° to -55° (orbits: 20, 61, 100, 103, 145, 148), longitudes +52° to +190° (orbits: 24, 71, 72, 97) (the numbers in italics represent inertial orbits) see Figure 5. The three sets of orbits for the second group are: longitudes -55° to -170° (orbits: 390, 386, 394, 397, 400, 401), longitudes +52° to -55° (orbits: 404, 405, 408, 410, 411, 426, 427, 428, 429, 430, 431), longitudes +52° to +190° (orbits: 414, 417, 418, 420, 421, 424, 425) (the numbers in italics represent inertial orbits). The three sets of longitudes are presented in different colors in Figure 5.

The methane mixing ratio decreases from Group 1 to Group 3 (Fig. 6): the best fit is obtained for the methane mixing ratios of 25±5, 15±5, 10±5 ppbv, respectively, for the 3 longitude ranges, going from eastern longitudes to western longitudes. However orbit 145 in Group 2 has the highest mixing ratio of any individual orbit implying that methane concentrations can be high in smaller regions within these longitudinal ranges. Previously, an upper limit of 20 ppbv of methane was obtained by Mariner 9 (17), and another one of 70±50 ppbv was inferred from ground-based observations (18). However, recently two ground-based detections of methane were reported (19, 20), with a mixing ratio of 11±4 ppbv (20), in agreement with the Mars Express PFS result for the global methane mixing ratio.

On Earth, the dominant source of methane is biogenic sources such as termites and cattle (21). Other sources of terrestrial methane include marshes, rice paddies, natural gas, lakes and oceans. On Mars, methane could be derived from biogenic sources such as subsurface microorganisms (2), or non-biogenic sources such as slow release of methane stored
in subsurface reservoirs, outgassing from volcanic/hydrothermal reservoirs or the destruction of meteoritic or cometary material during infall. We estimated the global methane mixing ratio produced by each of these sources. The observed global average mixing ratio of 10 ppbv, amounts to a column abundance of $2.2 \times 10^{15}$ cm$^{-2}$ CH$_4$ molecules at the surface of Mars. Assuming a CH$_4$ photochemical lifetime of $\sim 2 \times 10^{10}$ s near the surface (22, 23) we estimate that a flux of $\sim 1 \times 10^3$ molecules cm$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$ would be required to explain a CH$_4$ mixing ratio of 10 ppbv on Mars. Integrated over the planet this would amount to a source strength of $\sim 4$ g s$^{-1}$ or $\sim 126$ metric ton year$^{-1}$ of CH$_4$. Assuming a CH$_4$ photochemical lifetime of $\sim 2 \times 10^{10}$ s near the surface (6, 23) we estimate that a flux of $\sim 1 \times 10^5$ molecules cm$^{-2}$ s$^{-1}$ would be required to explain a CH$_4$ mixing ratio of 10 ppbv on Mars$^1$. Integrated over the planet this would amount to a methane source strength of $\sim 4$ g s$^{-1}$, i.e. $\sim 1.26 \times 10^5$ kg year$^{-1}$ or $\sim 126$ metric ton year$^{-1}$.

The flux of micrometeoritic dust at Mars is estimated to be $\sim 300$ g s$^{-1}$ or $\sim 9000$ ton year$^{-1}$ (24). Most of it would burn up in the atmosphere, but allowing for a generous 25% surviving to the surface (24), nearly 2300 ton year$^{-1}$ could reach the surface of Mars. If all of the micrometeoritic dust were assumed to be from carbonaceous chondrites, then organic materials would comprise about 3% of the flux (25), i.e. $\sim 70$ ton year$^{-1}$. If all of the organic materials could be converted to methane, then micrometeoritic sources of methane would be roughly comparable to that needed to explain the 10 ppbv measured with the PFS. However, the estimated necessary micrometeoritic source of methane is much greater than what could be realistically produced, because carbonaceous chondritic material is not representative of most meteorites, which are actually depleted in carbon, and whatever organics enter the martian atmosphere would most likely not be converted to methane in the planet’s oxidizing environment.

Comets are potentially the largest exogenous source of methane at Mars. From observations of eight Oort cloud comets, (26) conclude that the CH$_4$/H$_2$O mixing ratio lies in 0.15–1.5% range, with most comets showing >0.5% and one as high as 2.3%. For our estimate, we assume a cometary CH$_4$ of 1%, and that most of the mass of the comet is due to water ice. Taking an average impact rate of $1.6 \times 10^{-8}$/year for the ecliptic comets at Mars (27) and a typical cometary radius of 1 km, the amount of methane delivered to Mars by the comets would be on the order of 1 ton/year on average, i.e. less than 1% of that needed to maintain a steady state mixing ratio of 10 ppbv of methane on Mars. Because the lifetime of methane is only a few hundred years, the “average” flux from the comets is not a very meaningful quantity, considering the above rate of one impact every 62 million years. We have therefore considered the possibility that the methane on Mars is constantly declining, and that the quantity measured today may simply be a relic of a cometary impact that occurred in the past several hundred to thousands of years. We have calculated the size of comet, with the constraint that the impactor supplied enough methane (about three times the current abundance if the impact occurred one methane lifetime ago) so that $2.2 \times 10^{15}$ cm$^{-2}$ CH$_4$ molecules (10 ppbv) remain today on Mars. Our calculations (28) show that this requires an impact by a comet of radius as small as $\sim 130$ m that impacted Mars as recently as 100 years ago, to a radius as large as $\sim 360$ m that impacted it as long ago as 2000 years. The observed variability of methane over Mars may favor a recent impact, younger than one methane lifetime, unless some localized surface sinks are present to efficiently scavenge methane from the atmosphere. It is not presently known whether a single impact event of this type did actually take place, but it appears promising enough to warrant further investigation.

On the other hand, methane could have been formed by magmatic processes, or stored in methane hydrates for later release to the atmosphere. Terrestrial volcanoes are not a big source of methane, and large scale volcanism has not taken place on Mars for over 100 million years. However, small scale outgassing of methane cannot be ruled out. A potentially larger source of methane than volcanism may come from the alteration of basalt at T<150 °C, a process that results also in the wet phase conversion of original CO$_2$ into CH$_4$ in a supermafrost aquifer. In their chemical equilibrium computer model, (4) calculate that as much as 0.2 bar, or $\sim 10^{15}$ tons of CH$_4$ could have been produced if the only source of C in this region was the CO$_2$ initially present in the crustal pores. Methane could have been sequestered in stable methane hydrate and gradually risen to the planet’s surface (5). The rate of release to the atmosphere is unknown, but if one assumes that leakage has been taking place at a uniform rate over time, it would amount to $\sim 200,000$ tons/year, which is much greater than the one hundred tons or so per year needed to maintain a steady state mixing ratio of 10 ppbv of CH$_4$ on Mars today. Even if methane from the hydrate is being released at a rate that is a factor of 1000 slower, it would still be sufficient to account for the observations. Finally, recent laboratory experiments confirm abiogenic generation of methane in mineral-catalyzed hydrothermal reactions of (CO$_2$ and H$_2$O) at 390 °C and 400 bars (29), conditions that are likely to be encountered in subpermafrost aquifers or deep under the polar ice on Mars. Moreover, the catalysts used in the experiment – Fe-Cr oxide – are also believed to be present in the martian rocks.

If the source is biogenic and current, methanogens that use CO or H$_2$ for energy are candidate sources. Chemolithotrophic microbial ecosystems are common deep in the Earth's subsurface, and they release methane as a product of metabolism, as in 4CO + 2H$_2$O → CH$_4$ + 3CO$_2$, and 4H$_2$ +
CO₂ → CH₄ + 2H₂O (30–32). There exists a distinct possibility that in the subpermafrost aquifer environment of Mars, one or several microbial colonies may exist, where microorganisms utilize CO and/or H₂, and produce methane in turn (2, 3). The martian atmosphere provides a ready source of CO (~700 ppm, (33)) and H₂ (40–50 ppm H₂ based on models and observations, (34–37)). These gases are expected to diffuse through the regolith to the subsurface aquifers. Abundant H₂ may also be made available locally via the hydration of ultramafic silicates. It has been suggested that the source of methane need not be current. If microorganisms existed on Mars only in the past during its (possible) warm and wet phase and produced methane, that methane could have been stored in methane-hydrates for later release, as discussed above. A comparison of the CH₄ source strength at Mars (4 g s⁻¹) with that on Earth (1.67 × 10⁷ g s⁻¹, (38)) indicates that if methane on Mars is microbial in origin, the microbe population must be tiny. This is because nearly all of the 1700 ppbv of CH₄ in Earth’s atmosphere has its ultimate origin in living things, and the Martian source pales in comparison. It is important to point out that if microorganisms are or were present on Mars, the subpermafrost region is their most likely abode, as the presence of hydrogen peroxide, high UV radiation and the low temperature and low pressure at the surface of Mars, would render the surface hostile to life as we know it.

Finally, the relatively long lifetime of CH₄ implies that the CH₄ distribution is expected to be uniform over the planet once steady state is reached. The observed non uniform distribution of CH₄ is indicative of either localized source/s or localized sink/s, or both. Diffusion of CH₄ through the regolith into the interior of Mars is a distinct possibility. The surface loss could result in a non uniform distribution of methane on Mars, only if the process is more efficient than the time it takes for methane to become uniform, which is on the order of a few weeks or faster in the martian atmosphere. If the local surface sink, e.g. due to varying mineralogy including surface oxidants, is not as rapid, a cometary source for methane on Mars would be less viable. In summary, we want to stress that the detection of methane does not imply presence of life on Mars, now or in the past. It is one possibility, but, as shown above, other sources are at least as plausible (39).

References and Notes
1. See SOM-1 for definition.
8. The Mars Express spacecraft was launched on 2 June 2003, attained orbit around Mars on 25 December 2003, and, since February 2004, is in a polar orbit of 87° inclination, with a pericenter altitude of ~250 km, and an orbital period of 7.2 hours. PFS is one of the seven experiments on board. The primary science objectives of the PFS are: monitoring of 3-D temperature field, spatial and temporal variations of H₂O and CO, characterization of aerosols and clouds, and identification of trace species. Surface temperatures and spectral information about the composition of soil and polar deposits are also obtained.
11. See the discussion on SNR and NER in the SOM.
12. They cover the January 2004 through early February 2004 period (Lₐ = 330° 350°) and the May 2004 period. This period is long compared with the average transport period in the atmosphere (less than one week for global dust storms) and it is short with respect to the Martian year and a martian season.
13. See the discussion on the computation of synthetic spectra in the SOM.


22. The CH4 lifetime used in the calculations (~2 x 10^10 s near the surface) is taken from Wong et al., (2003, ref. 6). It also agrees with the value for the lower atmosphere shown in Fig. 2 of Summers et al. (2003, ref. 39). Since the photochemical loss of CH4 is due to oxidation by OH and O(1D) near the surface and by the solar UV above ~70 km, its lifetime can vary depending upon the solar UV flux, and the actual atmospheric water vapor and ozone distributions. The lifetime used in our calculations is based on average solar and martian conditions (150 ppm H2O at the surface), and it represents an e-folding time, or the time over which the concentration drops by a factor of exp(1) or 2.7, not by a factor of 2. For a methane lifetime that is shorter by a factor of two, the required methane flux would be roughly twice.


28. See the computation in SOM.


40. The PFS was built at the Istituto di Fisica dello Spazio Interplanetario (IFSI) of Istituto Nazionale di Astrofisica (INAF), and the investigation is being funded by the Italian Space Agency (ASI) in the context of the Italian participation to the Mars Express mission of ESA. S.A. acknowledges support from NASA/Jet Propulsion Laboratory for participation in the Mars Express Project. We are grateful to V. Cottini for a number of synthetic spectra computations.

**Supporting Online Material**

*www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/1101732/DC1*

**SOM Text**

Figs. S1 and S2

References and Notes

21 June 2004; accepted 18 October 2004
Published online 28 October 2004; 10.1126/science.1101732
Include this information when citing this paper.

**Fig. 1.** (A) A portion of the first averaged PFS spectrum (January-February 2004, black curve), with ±1σ confidence (red lines). The signal to noise ratio is about 1300. Methane is identified at 3018 cm⁻¹. There are three water lines (at 3003.5
at 3022 and at 3026 cm\(^{-1}\)) and two solar lines (at 3012 and 3014 cm\(^{-1}\)). The continuum slope is due to water ice clouds in the atmosphere. The small peak on the left of the main solar line is due to instrumental response function. (B) The second averaged PFS spectrum (May 2004) in the same frequency interval. The caption is the same as for Fig. 1A. The signal to noise ratio is about 1500.

Fig. 2. (A) Synthetic spectra computed for 0 ppbv (green curve), and 10, 20, 30, 40 and 50 ppbv of methane (violet curves), compared with the PFS average spectrum (thick black line). The synthetic spectra have been computed for a 6.7 mb of CO\(_2\) including 350 ppm of H\(_2\)O, along with dust and water ice clouds. The temperature profile obtained from simultaneous measurements in the thermal radiation has been used. (B) Same as (A) with the PFS mean spectrum shown in Fig. 1B.

Fig. 3. Average of 121 PFS spectra (black curve) and synthetic spectra with 35 ppbv of methane (red line) for orbit 145 of Mars Express (inertial attitude). The error on the measurements is shown as ±1σ confidence lines. The water vapor mixing ratio used for the synthetic spectrum is 600 ppmv.

Fig. 4. Average PFS spectrum (black curve) for orbit 72 of Mars Express (inertial attitude, air mass factor 2.1). The error on the measurements is shown as ±1σ confidence lines. PFS spectrum is an average over 120 measurements. A synthetic spectrum with 0 ppbv is shown in good agreement with the measurements. The water mixing ratio is 400 ppbv.

Fig. 5. Geographical distribution of the orbits considered: red (high methane mixing ratio), yellow (medium methane mixing ratio), blue (low methane mixing ratio). Note that strong fluctuations occur in each of the three categories, indicating the possible presence of localized sources.

Fig. 6. Methane variation with longitude. Average PFS spectra for the January period (thick lines) and for the May period (thin lines). Curves have been vertically displaced for clarity. Corresponding signal to noise ratios range between 900 and 1040. For the 55-170 degree longitude case of January (thick black), synthetic spectra with 20 and 30 ppbv of CH\(_4\) are shown. The best fit result is 25±5 ppbv CH\(_4\). Similarly, for the green curve, synthetic spectra with 10 and 20 ppbv of CH\(_4\) are shown, and the best fit is with 15±5 ppbv CH\(_4\). The red curve is shown with 0 and 10 ppbv synthetic spectrum: the best fit is with slightly less than 10 ppbv of methane. The thin curves (spectra obtained in May) show the same behaviour: fits are omitted for clarity.